What About Clinician Burnout, Anxiety, & PTSD during COVID-19?
What are the arts bringing to support them?

Alan Siegel, M.D.
Director, Art of Health and Healing
NOAH Founding Board Member
Chair, Clinician Burnout & Well-being Working Group
Hamster Wheel
Written by Alan Siegel
What If?

1. Colonoscopy
2. Basic Metabolic Panel
3. Expressive Arts Therapist
4. Therapeutic Harp
5. Neurology Consult
6. Wellness Classes
7. Food as Medicine Classes
8. Fleet’s Enema
9. Pet Therapy
Learning Objectives

1. To understand the state of clinician burnout, anxiety, and PTSD before and during COVID-19.

2. To learn about how the arts have been shown to help.

3. To engage with how NOAH (National Org for Arts in Health) and ARC Project (Arts for Resilience in Clinicians) are addressing this.

4. To share what is being done around the county utilizing the arts to address these problems for HCWs.
Our healers – pre-COVID

- Physicians – 50% rate of burnout
  - Poor satisfaction work-life integration
  - Increased risk for burnout vs. other working adults
  - Moral Injury as a cause
  - High levels of depression, increasing – 42%
  - Aware but don’t access MH services – 15%
Why is burnout important?

**Worse patient care**
- More medical errors (2x)
- Lower quality of care & pt satisfaction, longer recovery times

**Reduced physician workforce**
- Reduced physician productivity (2x higher planning to leave) = less pt access
- Lower job satisfaction

**Worse physician health**
- More substance abuse, poor self-care, more MVAs
- > 1 suicide/day (400/yr)
Death of 3,248 U.S. HCWs (as of 1/6/21)

Lost on the Frontline
Loss of HCW’s – COVID-19 (Jan, 2020)

Death by COVID-19 –
More than 1/2 less than 60yo
2/3 people of color
>1/3 born outside U.S. (esp. Philippines)
Many involved inadequate PPE
Majority early in Pandemic (esp. NY/NJ)

Nurses (1/3 of deaths) and support staff are most of deaths
Nurse 32%
Healthcare support 19%
Physician 17%
Medical first responder 8%
Admin/ Admin support 6%
44% worked at hospital – also residential facilities, o/p clinics, hospices & prisons

Suicide

She tried to do her job, and it killed her,” said the father of Dr. Lorna Breen.
Loss of HCWs – retirement/closing practices

‘Doctors are Calling it Quits Under Stress of the Pandemic’ – NY Times 11/15/20

• Survey 3,500 doctors by the Physicians Foundation - 8% doctors reported closing their offices in recent months (could equal some 16,000 practices). Another 4 % planned to shutter w/i the next year.

• Other doctors & nurses are retiring early or leaving their jobs.

• Primary Care Collaborative (nonprofit) group similar 9/20 – 20% PCPs say someone in their practice plans to retire early or has already retired because of Covid-19, and 15 % say someone has left or plans to leave the practice.

• About half already said their mental exhaustion was at an all-time high.

• ‘no end in sight’
Our health care workers – during COVID

Global:

- **Global study 60 countries** – 9/3/20 2,707 HCPs participated in this study. **51% HCPs reported burnout.**
  - High workload, job stress, time pressure, limited org support
  - **High-income countries > low- & middle-income countries**
- Japan study – overall burnout 31%
  - 47% nurses, 36% XR techs, 37% pharmacists
  - Risks: F>M, less days off/mo., more intentions of dropping out, lower age, less yrs of experience
- Italy – 50% PTSD, 25% depr, 20% anxiety, 10% insomnia
- Wuhan, China – high scores self-report anxiety, OCD behaviors, phobias, and somatization

U.S.

- UCSF study ER physicians – **60% increased levels burnout & anxiety**
- CMA March/April – extensive anxiety re: PPE, putting selves in harm’s way, distress re: delays in medical care.
1,119 healthcare workers
• 93% stress
• 86% anxiety
• 82% emotional exhaustion
• 77% frustration
• 76% exhaustion & burnout
• 75% overwhelmed
• 70% trouble with sleep
• 68% physical exhaustion
• 63% work-related dread
• 57% changes in appetite
• 56% physical symptoms e.g. headache or stomach ache
• 52% compassion fatigue

• Worried about exposing their loved ones
• Heightened awareness or attention to being exposed
• Lacking quality time or unable to support or be present for their children
• ½ questioning career path
• Inadequate emotional support.

Mental health surveys – stressed out and stretched too thin

Mental Health America survey - June-September, 2020. Released 12/1/20
Organizational Evidence-Based and Promising Practices for Improving Clinician Well-Being

- Domain 1 - Organizational Commitment
- Domain 2 - Workforce Assessment - measurement
- Domain 3 - Leadership
- Domain 4 - Policy
- Domain 5 - Efficiency and work environment
- Domain 6 – Support – culture of connection

- Not mentioned – arts – great for individual factors/support/connection
Evidence – the arts for health care workers
WHO Scoping Study (Fancourt and Finn, 2019)

Power of the arts:
• Decreased burnout - brief series art therapy (Tjasink 2018).
• HCWs perceived the arts decreased stress, reduced burnout, & improved mood, job performance, patient/staff relationships, & well-being (Wilson, 2015).
• Facilitates communication, promote self-care, & improve the wellbeing for professional hospice workers (Westrhenena 2012).
• Storytelling & acts of reflection valuable for HCW mental health.
• Medical education (>50% med schools) improve well-being, clinical skills of observation, & improve promotion of humanism (Rodenhauser 2012).
NOAH Leadership Summit

• Strategic Plan
  • Awareness – value of arts for HCW
    • Present others’ conferences
    • Work with NAM
  • Playbook/Tools – support org level
    • Create toolkit for programs/systems
    • **Survey of active HCW programs (including Effects of COVID, could be scoping study
ARC — Arts for Resilience in Clinicians

• Video — supportnoahsarc.com
• Artists and art therapists leading:
  • Videos
  • Virtual classes
  • Virtual sessions – individuals/small groups
  • National & local HCW artists to lead
  • National & local artists to lead, DEI emphasis
• Starting pilot NY Health April, 2021
• Collaborating on prototype at Inova Schar Cancer Center/Smith Center (Northern VA) – Scott Stoner
• Website for all HCWs – free resources
• Expressive Arts Workbook for HCWs
ARC Health Care Worker (HCW) Portal

- ARC/NOAH Info
- Special ‘member-only’ area for HCW to engage in the arts
  - Videos
  - Host classes
  - Collaborative projects
  - Resources/links
  - Area to post HCW art
- Weekly blog with art prompts
- Resource list – articles/links about burnout, arts as a solution
Help Us Heal Our Healers

The National Organization for Arts in Health (NOAH) is launching a new program that will provide health care workers the type of release and self-care they need to help them fight COVID-19 burnout and manage their stress during this critical time.

NOAH's Arts for Resilience in Clinicians (ARC) project will offer health care workers free expressive art programs created to help combat burnout and anxiety, and manage the day-to-day pressures that can impact their mental wellbeing and work performance. Through a series of videos and virtual sessions available online or through a customized app, they will be able to access this vital support tool any time they choose.

Please join us in our effort to bring the comfort and support our health care heroes need now!
Why ARC:
Helps to alleviate helplessness and isolation, burnout and stress while participating in the expressive arts.

- The first response, I can’t draw.
  
  - Creating a safe space virtually. Choices.

- Non-verbal communication. Relax or engage.
  
  - Expressing Grief. Virtual community, sharing or not sharing.
NOAH Survey - Arts-based Services Addressing Health Care Workers/Staff Wellbeing

• Answered survey: 94 (as of Wednesday, January 27, 2021)
• 53 completed most of survey (those in health care system and have program for HCW)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programs:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts General Hospital, Harvard Medical School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U of KY HealthCare Arts in HealthCare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houston Methodist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centra &amp; Westminster Canterbury Lynchburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rush University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas Health Dallas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati Arts Association &amp; Hospice of Cincinnati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Center at University Settlement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baton Rouge General MC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylvester Comprehensive Cancer Ctr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MetroHealth (Cleveland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCU Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owensboro Health Regional Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati Arts Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contra Costa Health Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayo Clinic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaiser Permanente</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frontline Arts, Penn State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knoxville Symphony Orchestra, U of Tennesse MC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute for Integrative Health &amp; Walter Reed Natl Military MC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYU Langone Medical Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanford Vermillion Medical Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rady Children's Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Place To Be and Inova Hospital System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Luke's U. Hospital Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dartmouth-Hitchcock Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Truman Medical Center, UMKC_SOM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gifts of Art at University of Michigan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgetown Lombardi Arts and Humanities Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hearts Need Art serving Methodist Healthcare System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Louisiana Arts &amp; Healthcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical U of SC Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wolfson, Baptist, St Vincent, Mayo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perelman School of Medicine, U of Penn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sing for Hope/Maimonides Cancer Center and White Plains Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healing Arts Medicine</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Q4: In the setting where you work or volunteer, are the expressive or creative arts programs and experiences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANSWER CHOICES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Specifically designed for HCWs</td>
<td>8.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Designed to serve patients as well as HCW/staff</td>
<td>75.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No programs for HCWs</td>
<td>15.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Q5: "I feel that our program is an example of best practice."

You Are a Work of Art - incorporates elements of best practice for the development, team structure, and delivery of services for HCW
Rx/Museum - impact of clinicians' well-being and professionalism via mixed methods analysis of longitudinal exposure to the visual arts.
Art of Health and Healing - Healing Through Creativity event – brings HCW together to show their creative side w/visual arts, performance, expressive arts, self-care
Compassion fatigue workshops, resiliency
Art cart program – engage artmaking, art kits for break rooms
Gratitude Gram – medical staff receive personalized email and video from a musician
Storytelling
Q10: Location of programming
• Outdoors
• Telehealth/Online & via snail mail
• Local cultural organizations
• Cancer centers (now virtually due to the pandemic)
• Hospice
• Partnership with university fine arts department & community arts agencies
• Touring local art museums and art studios
• Medical College
• Hospice in-patient facilities AND visiting nurses' offices
Q18: Which HCWs are served by this program?
Q20: Has your arts program been included as part of the wellness/well-being program at your institution?
Q21: How is your arts program for HCW funded?
Q22: How has your arts-based program for HCWs shifted since COVID-19?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANSWER CHOICES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expansion of staff programming</td>
<td>26.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decrease or loss of staff programming</td>
<td>28.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change of program to virtual</td>
<td>42.86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No change</td>
<td>2.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Q23: What types of arts-based experiences are directly provided to HCWs?
Q24: Where do activities for HCWs take place?

- On individual units
- In specially designated places
- Virtually (i.e.,...)

Answered: 46  Skipped: 42
Q29: What is the response to your programming by your HCWs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANSWER CHOICES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Highly valued</td>
<td>63.83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat valued</td>
<td>8.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicated improvements in burnout, anxiety, depression, PTSD</td>
<td>6.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t have data</td>
<td>4.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>17.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ex.– Expressive Arts – Art of Health & Healing

• Staff Wellness Program, $12K grant from Hospital Foundation
• 20 videos – arts-based, 15-20 min., self-care
  • Yoga sessions with identified levels
  • Movement videos
  • Cooking videos to promote healthy eating
  • Meditation
  • Relaxation
  • Stress Management
  • Do It Yourself Home Art Projects
  • Breathing
  • Get Moving, Keep Moving, Being Physically Active
• Once/wk. virtual classes
• Community mural, 4” canvas- In-person, outside workshops – hope & gratitude
• Expressive Arts Workbook for staff
Expressive Arts Are A Powerful Tool for our HCWs

- HCWs need it! Burnout, Anxiety, PTSD
- It’s worse already & going to get even worse w/ COVID, & decline of COVID
- The arts are good for well-being in HCWs
- We all need to advocate to bring these arts-based tools widely to HCWs
- ARC – Arts for Resilience in Clinicians – working to bring this to HCWs mostly virtually. Web portal for all HCW
- Program survey
- Resource List
Visit us at www.theNOAH.net

Alan Siegel, M.D.
doctoralan@gmail.com

ARC@TheNOAH.net
Facebook @noahsarcproject